

The background of the slide is a photograph of the interior of Lambeth Palace Library. It features high vaulted ceilings with dark wooden beams, large arched windows, and long wooden bookshelves filled with books. The lighting is warm and golden.

**CSWupdate**  
NOVEMBER 2012

# *Q&A with Claire McEachern*

At Lambeth Palace Library, London, Claire McEachern did research on the “intellectual daughters of Sir Anthony Cooke” with support from a CSW Faculty Development Grant.

## MOOD AND MATH

While usually my girls (ages seven, five and five) are excited by the prospect of red and white pinwheel mints awaiting them in the post-voting area, this time around they were not so thrilled to go. I found myself speaking an extra cheerful running monologue on how great it was that we were going to decide who would be president, smiling widely at those who were leaving our polling place having cast their ballots, but getting only tight perfunctory smiles in return. "I'm scared. Too many people," said one of my twins from behind the curtain she'd created out of my pant leg as I inked my ballot. Later, when dropping the girls at school, our kindergarten teacher shared her own thoughts on the election: "The mood is so different, not like the last presidential election where everyone was so hopeful. You can feel it; I'm very worried."

In hindsight, it is easy to proclaim the Democrats overly pessimistic and Republicans overly optimistic. The mood on campus was palpably anxious on the day before the election. Even those wiser friends using New

York Times' statistician Nate Silver's reports as flu shot in the days leading up to the election were infected by the smog-stress.

What do we make of this striking dissonance between mood—emotional rhetoric aka spin doctoring—and math? Or put another way, how might gender and feminism help us to understand that mood and math? Math, or at least, layman invocations of 1%, 99%, 47%—statistical language to express discontent and sense of shrinking opportunity—were certainly crucial to the outcome of this election. For higher education in particular, the dueling arithmetic on which proposition (30 or 38) gave what percentage of revenue garnered from which formula of income or sales tax on which percent of the population filled the yahoo boards of bantering mommies, at least at my local public magnet, with confusion and minor disagreements. How do these local events draw upon and transform stereotypes of boys being good at math and girls at social and emotional intelligence, when the Biggest Boy Rove had clearly ignored the math

and succumbed to his own rhetorical (terrorizing, falling off a cliff) spin on Obama's stewardship of the nation and the American people's lack of faith in it?

While not having the answers to the above questions, I offer them as provocation not to fetishize statistics and clear calculations (the hagiography of Nate Silver already does that) but to contemplate seriously the social and civil mood—aka the qualitative atmosphere of our decision-making processes and political action. The late scholar and polymath Teresa Brennan, who was also concerned with the way we could feel the atmosphere upon entering a room, used the term "affect" to name the circulating vital energies carried by hormones, pheromones, and other airborne neurochemicals. Using diverse sources—from biochemistry, neurology, theology, crowd theory, clinical practice, and psychoanalysis—Brennan takes aim at the "foundational fantasy" that we are self-contained individuals and pursues the longstanding (ancient) understanding of a "social well-spring" from which affects flow and in which our bodies

are bathed. In this portrait, humans are nodal points for the transfer, projection, reception, and transformation of depleting and enhancing energies among and between us. We attach the agitation in the air felt by our bodies to some narrative that makes sense of it. Put more concretely, campaign discourse filled the air to such an extent that it became a tropical storm-- a worry that became "Obama's not going to be re-elected" or "Obama's going to be re-elected."

Useful for my purposes here (the tie-in to electoral politics, if only punningly), Brennan spoke of "the masculine party," populated by beings of either sex, projecting their unwanted affects, such as aggression, onto a "feminine" other. Also a being of either sex, this "feminine" party internalizes that aggression as depression or anxiety: "The feminine party, while carrying the masculine other's disordered affects, also gives that other living attention . . . Depression, in men or women, is a feminine affect, aggression a masculine one" (43). Speaking of affects as circulating vital energies (of aggression, depression and caring attention), Brennan uses her gendered terms to differentiate the habituated, somaticized modes connected to historical divisions of labor wherein the masculine party (and she extends this to colonizers) direct negative emo-

tions outward via aggression toward others, whereas the feminine party (and she extends this to the colonized and poor) serve as receptacles of that emotional dumping.

For me the most salient post-election report came from NPR coverage of women's role in government that led with numbers highlighting the disparity between the percentage of women in the electorate (women are 50.8% of the U.S. population and 52% of likely voters) and the percentage of female congressional representatives (18–19% in the House and 20% in the Senate).<sup>1</sup> What gave flesh to these statistics, however, was not the math (the difference between the figures) but the subsequent salience of that accounting told in this anecdote: women speak less in absolute, durational terms and less about the issues they care about unless there is a parity threshold of women in the room, not because they are naturally silent (passive) but because men (here synonymous with Brennan's masculine parties) regularly cut them off with much greater frequency than they do their male counterparts.<sup>2</sup> (When men

are in the minority, however, they do not correspondingly speak less.) If we explained this difference only in terms of the numbers, well, we couldn't explain it at all. Changing the mood in the United States, thus, becomes a matter of both the math and feminine affect.

Let me finish this opening Interim Director's reflection not by arguing that the calculative reasoning—aka "the math"—reigns the day, but that our emotional intelligence has been severely narrowed by the habit of silo-ization (going it alone, maverick reliance on only the self), one supported by the ideology of neoliberalism—the idea not only that the market decides everything best but that the social sphere should bear all of the costs of industries and markets while all of the profit of the same should accrue to the private sphere. Our social sphere becomes that which should also bear the dumping of incredible aggressive "masculine" external energies . . . and who exactly is internalizing those energies and reshaping them?

— Rachel Lee

1. These figures are from the 2010 census and a Gallup poll from the most recent election.

2. Or unless the deliberative body makes conscious efforts toward procedural inclusivity. See Tali Mendelberg's contribution to the segment of "To the Point: Women's Issues across Party Lines" hosted by Warren Olney and broadcast on Friday, November 9, 2012. According to Mendelberg, the issues women care about include healthcare for the poor, taking care of the disabled, and tending to the needs of children. See also Mendelberg and Christopher Karpowitz's *New York Times* Op-Ed "More Women, but Not Nearly Enough," on November 8, 2012, <http://campaignstops.blogs.nytimes.com/2012/11/08/more-women-but-not-nearly-enough/>

november 2012

CSWupdate



7

**Claire McEachern is Professor of English at UCLA. Her project, "The intellectual daughters of Sir Anthony Cooke, 1526-1609," is a cultural biography of four sisters whose lives intersected with many of the most formative events of sixteenth-century England. McEachern received a CSW Faculty Development Grant to support this project in 2011.**



**Q & A WITH**

# *Claire McEachern*

HER RESEARCH FOCUSES ON FOUR SISTERS WHO WERE RENOWNED FOR THEIR OWN SCHOLARLY WORK



**Portrait of Elizabeth Hoby,  
1528 - 1609, hanging in the  
Great Hall at Bisham Abbey,**

*What drew you to the study of religion in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century British literature?*

In this period, early modern religion is where all the action is: political, intellectual, emotional, scientific, and of course literary. I came of scholarly age in the moment of new historicism, with an intention to become a Shakespearean scholar. I thought my dissertation, a study of the poetics of nationhood in Shakespeare's plays and the works of other writers, would be a study of early modern political identities—I wondered why we find in such texts what sounds to us like patriotic language, when scholars of state formation argue that nations aren't invented until the nineteenth century? In doing the research, I came to understand that

sixteenth-century notions of community were based in the Reformation revisions of religious identity (for instance, the liturgical and linguistic descriptions of community proposed by the *Book of Common Prayer*) and that to study political identities in this period meant grappling with the way religion imagined the bonds between persons, places and polities.

*What led you to your current research project on the intellectual daughters of Sir Anthony Cooke—Mildred Cecil, Anne Bacon, Elizabeth Hoby (shown at left), and Katherine Killegrew? What is interesting to you about the lives of these sisters?*

In researching a book on what it meant to believe in your own salvation in the wake of the Reformation, and what that might have had to do with how we believe in Shakespeare's

plays, I came across a reference to the “intellectual daughters of Sir Anthony Cooke” in a history of the early English Reformation. I wondered who they were and why I had never heard of them—recent descriptions of early modern women’s identity, very like those of the original period, tend to note Elizabeth I as “alone of all her sex” in her learning and accomplishments, an exception to the general rule of “chaste, silent and obedient.” I went looking and found that these four sisters (of nine children) were educated by their father in humanist literature and languages, whose own learning had brought him to the attention of Queen Katherine Parr, in her effort to educate Henry VIII’s three children; the intensity of his commitment to Protestantism led him to become a Marian exile when Mary Tudor sought to return England to Catholicism. Prior to their marriages these women were renowned for their scholarly work in translations of major texts of reform, and reissued editions later in life (in addition to modern languages, they were competent in Latin, Greek, and Hebrew, the rare trifecta of humanist learning). Two of the sisters married men who became prominent councilors to Elizabeth I (William Cecil, Nicholas Bacon); another married a famous humanist (Thomas Hoby, translator of *The Courtier* of Castiglione); another a noted diplomat (Henry Killebrew). As members of

a large and not especially prominent gentry family, their intellectual capital was clearly a major component of their dowries. They published translations of important texts of English Protestantism, wrote their own poetry, supervised the education of brilliant children and stepchildren (including the philosopher Francis Bacon and his cousin Robert Cecil), served as patrons of artists and musicians and dissident preachers, and, being both long-lived and socially prominent, had fingers in many of the sixteenth-century’s most interesting political pies. They served in diplomatic capacities, as life-long friends of the Queen, and as administrators of their own property (which gave widows control over the assignment of religious livings). The two eldest were ladies-in-waiting to both Catholic Mary and Protestant Elizabeth Tudor, and the scope of their political involvement seemed to revise what I had been taught about what was possible for women in this moment (Elizabeth Hoby Russell, for instance, represented her own interests in a Star Chamber case). But perhaps most fascinating of all, they advocated throughout their lives for the more intense Calvinist strains of Protestantism, even as their husbands worked to engineer the Elizabethan settlement of religion (what would become the Anglican church) along less strident principles. Thus in addition to complicating

my understanding of early modern women’s work, their involvements seem to me to paint a world of religious identities very different from the partisan understanding scholars have had of this moment: to suggest, for instance, how species of Protestantism could vary by members of the same family, or even within a marriage.

*You used the CSW Faculty Development Grant funds to travel to the Lambeth Palace Library in London to read the letters of Lady Anne Bacon, née Cooke. Can you tell us about some of your most interesting finds?*

Lady Anne’s letters to her sons Anthony and Francis provide the only substantive record of a “voice” for any of the sisters; the reason we possess them is because Anthony was a member of the Elizabethan intelligence network. She is the sister most intensely committed to reformed Protestantism, and the clarity and vehemence of her opinions is very evident throughout (her penmanship alone—bold, large, scrawling strokes of the quill—makes quite an impression). They date from the 1590s, when Lady Anne (b. 1528) was in her 70s. These letters are on the one hand a record of what kinds of things an early modern helicopter mother concerned herself with: she complains about their borrowing her coach and cart, and sends periodic shipments



of strawberries and pigeons from her home in Gorhambury, accompanied with warnings about the religious persuasions of her son's cooks or other hazards ("beware in any wise of the Lord H., he is a dangerous intelligencing man No doubt a subtle papist"). On the other, they demonstrate what we would consider a rather modern blend of the multiple roles required of an aristocratic woman: advice about politics, requests for sensitive information (when she felt the need for secrecy, she wrote in Hebrew or Greek), and descriptions of the administrative labors of running an estate. She even demonstrates a self-consciousness of the unique but nonetheless authoritative nature of her position. My favorite bit was from a letter of 12 May, 1595, when, clearly wondering whether her sons are heeding her words, she writes "I think for my long attending in court and a chief councilor's wife, few [women precede] me, son, are able or be alive to speak, and of such proceedings and worldly doings of men. But God bless you and make you to hear wholesome public doctrine for your best understanding every way."

*Are there any other archival collections you examining?*

I will need to comb through the Cecil Papers at Hatfield house, and of course the British State Papers, whose online archives I wish the UCLA library would subscribe to!

☛ *My goal is to tell the story of a particular and rather unusual family; while there is always a risk of generalizing from particulars. I would also like to add texture to current understandings of early modern English women and English religion.*

*What is your goal for the project? How will it advance knowledge of women's roles during this period? Is there anything you would like to share about what the project means to you?*

Records of most early modern lives (whether male and female) are notoriously patchy; but I wondered if, given that there were four of them, it would be possible to write a composite biography of these women. I'm hoping it will help that Mildred's husband, William Cecil, was the person who in essence conceived of the British office of public records. My goal is to tell the story of a particular and rather unusual family; while there is always a risk of generalizing from particulars, I would also like to add texture to current understandings of early modern English women and English religion. As I am by training a literary critic,

more used to dealing with imaginary people, the impact of language and the realm of interpretation, there is something refreshing about feeling (however naively) like I am uncovering something about "real" lives, and the project is requiring me to learn a different set of research skills. However, given the nature of the evidence, writing this book requires some methodological reflection about what the relation is between the kind of stories we want to tell and those we feel we are able to tell. I must also confess that part of me identifies with these sisters, as their lives seem to me to represent a very familiar blend (and clash) of the diverse forms of labor unique to women scholars today (minus, of course, the espionage and the servant problems).

**Elena Shih is a doctoral candidate in the Department of Sociology at UCLA, where her research focuses on the global anti-human trafficking movement in China and Thailand. She received an Honorable Mention for CSW's Constance Coiner Award in 2012.**



# Health and Rights at the Margins

## *Linking Human Trafficking and HIV/AIDS Among Jingpo Women in Ruili City, China*

**BY ELENA SHIH**

IN JULY, the International AIDS Conference drew more than twenty thousand participants. Held in Washington, D.C., it was the first since 1990 to convene in the U.S., because the U.S. recently lifted a ban that previously denied visas to HIV-positive persons. Still, the attendance of global participants was confined by another constraint of visa regulations: non-U.S.-citizen sex workers are still systematically denied visas. In protest, activists for the rights of sex workers, who typically take an active role in IAC activities, convened in Kolkata for an anti-conference, “Freedom Festival,” which celebrated the rights of sex workers and protested the marginalization of this community against the backdrop of the larger hegemonic movement to combat HIV/AIDS. During the anti-conference, alongside clear disdain for their exclusion from some parts of the HIV/AIDS movement, one of the loudest messages was a cry that sex worker rights are being infringed by the human trafficking movement (Sil 2012). The global concern





**Top: International AIDS Conference, 2012, took place in Washington, DC; Middle/Bottom: Sex Workers' "Freedom Festival" was organized in Kolkata, India, because non-U.S.-citizen sex workers are still systematically denied visas.**

around human trafficking has—in the name of prevention—increased the surveillance and policing of sex workers globally, making their work more precarious and frequently labeling it criminal. This contradiction propels my overarching question of how the HIV/AIDS and human trafficking movements are linked.

Empirically, I look at a site that exemplifies the complex field of study of “Women’s Health and Empowerment,” the name of the Center of Expertise for the UC Global Health Institute from which I received a student grant to conduct this small research study. In Ruili City, on the China-Myanmar line, the flow of drugs, people, goods, and disease converge on the lives of indigenous and ethnic minority peoples living on both sides of the border. Ethnic minority peoples in Ruili are both geographically and ethnically disenfranchised, due to their isolation from China’s economic hubs and preferential policies for Han majorities. Because of its location just above the Golden Triangle, linking opium-producing areas in Vietnam, Laos, Thailand and Myanmar, farmers in Ruili grew poppy for opium for sale to Myanmar. Located far from the central government in Beijing, this illicit trade lasted until the economic reform era of the 1980s, during which sweeping attempts to formalize economic markets brought drastic changes. Poppy



**In Ruili City, on the China-Myanmar line, the flow of drugs, people, goods, and disease converge on the lives of indigenous and ethnic minority peoples living on both sides of the border.**

fields in Yunnan were burned to show intolerance for drug trade, but the burning made the land unusable for agriculture (Fu 2005; Hyde 2005).

Given the lack of economic opportunities for income generation, many turn to the heroin trade. Communities of ethnic minority drug mules are often paid in the heroin they traffic and in 1989, Ruili was documented as the city where the first cases of HIV were discovered in China when a study found that 146 injecting drug users in Ruili were HIV positive. In the past 20 years, Dehong Prefecture (which contains Ruili City) has consistently ranked



first in rates of HIV infection and AIDS-related death in Yunnan Province, China's southwesternmost province that shares borders with Myanmar, Laos and Vietnam. The Jingpo, who share bloodlines with Burmese, are among the most severely affected; many of them have become heroin-dependent and HIV positive. In the two villages where I conduct this study, the Chinese CDC has reported as high as an 80% HIV infection rate among men (ACWF 2000, Hyde 2005).



To investigate the links between human trafficking and HIV/AIDS vulnerability among women of Jingpo ethnicity who live on the China-Myanmar border, this project asks: How does ethnic disenfranchisement make women susceptible to both HIV and human trafficking?

The excitement around "human trafficking" as a buzzword has obscured the links between trafficking in persons and existing flows of illicit goods and drugs and disease. The global concern around human trafficking has provoked



a transnational justice movement, formally spearheaded in 2000 by the United Nations Palermo Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons. These transnational norms are transplanted locally through regional global governance mechanisms such as the United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Human Trafficking (UNIAP), which exerts significant pressure on the Chinese state to adopt the guidelines on human trafficking. However, the definition of human trafficking remains





contested by different ideological factions of the movements and by local governments.

In 2008, China signed its first five-year National Plan of Action Against Human Trafficking; however, China has yet to adopt the international definition of human trafficking, acknowledging only the trafficking of women and children for the purposes of forced prostitution, forced marriage, and child kidnapping. Notably missing from the Chinese definition is the trafficking of men and trafficking for the purposes of labor exploitation. As has been documented by feminist scholars, the Chinese focus on women and children as true victims leads to a dangerously dichotomous portrayal of men as criminals and perpetrators (Bernstein 2008; Doezema 2000).

These dichotomous identities are dangerous for China's Jingpo community because men are disproportionately affected by HIV/AIDS and both women *and* men are subordinated by state policies that favor urban and Han majority citizens. These areas are already subject to heavy scrutiny and policing because of high rates of HIV/AIDS. During the late 1990s, the Chinese Centers for Disease Control entered villages in Ruili and tested men who had admitted to using intravenous drugs. During the time, women were not tested nor were they given education about how to reduce transmission. Since the late 1990s, in light of the growing crisis of HIV/AIDS, the Chinese government has pursued an aggressive campaign of HIV/AIDS prevention through fear and stigma propaganda campaigns. Slogans associating HIV infection with death and labeling it antithetical to modernization told local residents that their ethnicity was part of their disease. These campaigns do little to target the root causes of vulnerability, instead suggesting that intravenous drug use and disease are products of backwards ethnic minority behavior (Joag 2005; Fu 2006).

Since 2000, Chinese government and UNIAP programs have pursued humanitarian campaigns that boast prevention and protection efforts against human trafficking. However,

from a policy and implementation perspective, the counter-trafficking movement is viewed as distinct from the HIV/AIDS movement due to unique and competing funding streams for both issues. Stigmatizing populations that are vulnerable to HIV/AIDS and human trafficking is dangerous because it stems from an essentialist discourse that regards victims of trafficking as *true* victims, while those affected by HIV/AIDS are viewed as deserving of disease for having made bad choices. While Chinese government agencies have established anti-trafficking action plans, the social marginalization of ethnic minority women makes them ineligible for, or mistrustful of, government services.

This preliminary research has been conducted through a local community arts project, the Border Statements Collective (<http://www.the-borderartsproject.org/>), which provides no-cost public arts education as a tool of empowerment and education for ethnic minority youth living in Ruili villages. As the co-founder of this project, I have worked with youth in this area since 2006 but most recently have been interviewing women 16 and older to ask about experiences with educational, job, migration, and marriage opportunities, experience with HIV/AIDS, and awareness of human trafficking.

Despite the aggressive anti-drug and anti-AIDS campaigns, many Jingpo villagers,

**This preliminary research has been conducted through a local community arts project, the Border Statements Collective (<http://www.theborderartsproject.org/>), which provides no-cost public arts education as a tool of empowerment and education for ethnic minority youth living in Ruili villages. As the co-founder of this project, I have worked with youth in this area since 2006 but most recently have been interviewing women 16 and older to ask about experiences with educational, job, migration, and marriage opportunities, experience with HIV/AIDS, and awareness of human trafficking.**

especially women living in HIV/AIDS-affected families, lack basic information about HIV control and prevention. Fear and stigma campaigns alone feature ethnic minority men who are backward and diseased, causing many women to seek opportunities for outward migration at any cost, leaving them vulnerable to human trafficking through forced migration, forced marriage to Han families, and forced prostitution. HIV is perceived as a death sentence, and the female partners of infected men see the disease as linked to forms of intimate partner violence. For instance, a woman I interviewed echoed many sentiments expressed by others: “My husband died two years ago. All of his brothers are also sick. For the past five years, he became so weak that he couldn’t work on the farm anymore, which put him in a bad mood. After his youngest brother died [of AIDS related illness] all he does is drink and smoke *cacou* every once in a while. He gets crazy when he drinks. He would scream and yell and throw me around in front of [daughter’s name]...At the end, he lived with his mother and we live on our own.” The stories women share of their experience with HIV/AIDS mainly center around increased rates of alcoholism, violence, and widowing, which have led to a growing mistrust of men.

Meanwhile, forced marriage is one of the most prevalent forms of human trafficking in this

region, stemming from male-skewed gender ratios resulting from the one-child policy and long-standing practices of bride selling. Take Ma, who was recruited by a fellow Jingpo woman for marriage into a Han family in northern China. Ma initially agreed to be sold for a one-time fee of 15,000 RMB (\$2,400 USD) in order to pay for her mother’s debts following the death of her father in Ruili. Once Ma arrived in northern China, the recruiter took the money from the Han family, and it became clear that she would not give any to Ma’s family, would not let Ma contact anyone at home, and would not let Ma leave the family until she had a child. Ma didn’t speak Mandarin, and despite feeling socially isolated she did not think to escape because of the remoteness of the region she was in, her unfamiliarity with it, and mistrust of local Han police and government. Ma eventually did eventually convince her husband, through a genuine love bond she said they developed, to allow her to come back to Ruili. Once in Ruili, she convinced her husband to move to Ruili with her, and eventually he agreed. His decision, she noted, remarked on how rural areas across China have limited opportunities for growth, and how living in a rural village in Yunnan Province was really no different to her husband. She shared that there are many Jingpo

women still living in northern provinces across China, and that most are tricked out of money when they arrive, but eventually do what they can to survive there since they perceive marriage options at home to be dim.

The result of HIV/AIDS stigma has turned voluntary migration and arranged marriage into an economic pathway out of these areas. Ethnicity increases vulnerability once in those destinations; for instance, many are mistrustful of government services and fear arrest or deportation. After having children in the destination, many Jingpo wives—who at this point consider themselves victims of forced marriage because their families were not paid and they were not given certain freedoms to return home—do not see a possibility in returning home. While others have documented the role that shame plays in a returning trafficked person's reintegration, there is also a sense of futility in returning to a community ravaged by disease, death, and abuse. The pride and hope in leaving the ethnic community behind is rooted in a growing mistrust of men as conduits of disease.

Overall, this research suggests that the root causes of vulnerability to HIV/AIDS and human trafficking are not the same. Vulnerability to dangerous migration is exacerbated by government stigma campaigns toward HIV/

AIDS. Government fear and stigma campaigns make women vulnerable by tearing at the fabric of social and family life. Women are more inclined to seek dangerous migration as an option for upward mobility. Prioritizing human trafficking as a problem of women and children as true victims obfuscates general rights issues for men *and* women. Rather than focus on victimhood as the lens through which we understand vulnerability, we should continue asking how women are specifically impacted by vulnerabilities in this area.

The preliminary findings of this research suggest that the problems of human trafficking and HIV/AIDS must be understood through an intersectional framework that understands the phenomena as connected, though they are commonly regarded as distinct in human rights and public health discourses. Interventions could target destigmatization to increase moral support within the community. As an ethnic minority community with dying cultural practices, arts-based interventions for community building are particularly appropriate in this case because they revive communities on the basis of ethnic strength, which is exactly what state propaganda campaigns blame for creating social problems. Finally, the global shift toward regarding human trafficking as the single most perilous phenomenon of the

current age obscures ongoing issues of vulnerability and cultural stigma for ethnic minority peoples globally.

## REFERENCES

- Bernstein, E. (2008). "Introduction to Special Issue: Sexual Commerce and the Global Flow of Bodies, Desires, and Social Policies." *Sexuality Research & Social Policy*, 5(4), 1-5.
- China National Plan of Action on Combating Trafficking in Women and Children* (2008-2012)
- Doezema, J. (2000) "Loose Women or Lost Women? The Re-emergence of the Myth of White Slavery in Contemporary Discourse of Trafficking in Women." *Gender Issues*, 18 (1), 23-50, 2000.
- Fu, G. (2005). "A Community Without Gods: HIV/AIDS and Injecting Drug Use in Banyang Village, Ruili City." Master's thesis for Department of Ethnology, Chinese Central University of Nationalities.
- Hyde, S. (2007). *Eating Spring Rice: The Cultural Nature of AIDS in China's Southwest*. California: UC Press.
- Joag, S. (2009). "Infected Objects: The Criminalization of Infected Bodies Through the Construction of the Materiality of HIV/AIDS Stigma." Master's thesis for Program in Crime Social Control and Globalization, London School of Economics.
- Sil, Sailendra (2012) "Sex workers denied US visa hold their own AIDS conference" *Associated Foreign Press*. Jul 21, 2012.
- United Nations Palermo Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons* (2000), Convention Against Organized Crime.

**Laura E. Enriquez is a doctoral candidate in sociology. Her dissertation project explores the ways in which legal status, gender, and education affect how undocumented young adults participate in U.S. society and feel a sense of belonging. She received CSW's Constance Coiner Award in 2012.**



## LESSONS FROM THE FIELD

# Researching and Learning from Undocumented Young Adults

BY LAURA E. ENRIQUEZ



**I**T HAS BEEN FIVE YEARS since I attended my first undocumented-student organization meeting at a local university. While I went looking for information for my undocumented high school student mentees, I ended up talking to members about their educational experiences. These conversations became interviews and led to my first project on undocumented students' pathways to college. Becoming more involved in the undocumented immigrant youth movement, I have continued



my research on undocumented young adults.

As a feminist of color and an academic interested in community-based research, my mentors had taught me to think about the power dynamics inherent to my research. I was committed to ideals of reciprocity in which I would use my research to give back to the undocumented community I was researching rather than simply recording their stories and retreating to my office. As such, I have made an effort to make my research findings available to a broader audience, as well as to advise undocumented young adults whom I have met during fieldwork. I believe that these endeavors are integral both to resisting the social institutions that create marginalization and to empowering individuals to counter these forces.

Over the years, I have learned to think of research as a collective project where communities give us information for our research and we seek appropriate outlets for putting our research products back into the communities. While scholars talk about this form of reciprocity, we don't always think about the ways in which our research and our research participants can also change and affect us as individuals. While my research has led to a wealth of significant findings about the lives of undocumented young adults, it has also taught me a lot about my own life. Talking to countless undoc-



umented young adults about concepts of citizenship, membership, and rights has taught me a lot about the significance of citizenship in my own life. I share three of these lessons from the field with you now in hopes that their experiences will transform your conceptions of citizenship as much as they have transformed mine.

### **Recognize the Privileges Citizens Have**

As the member of the majority group, citizens often do not think about the significance of citizenship in their lives. Spending time with undocumented young adults and listening to their stories quickly brings some of these privileges to light.

**Physical Mobility:** Citizens have physical mobility. If they have a car, they can drive wherever they like without fear. Travelling to another state or country does not include worrying about

being apprehended by airport security or being barred from returning. Undocumented immigrants in California and most other states are not allowed to apply for driver's licenses and often depend upon public transportation and rides from friends to get to where they need to go. In Los Angeles, this dependence can mean spending long hours commuting on multiple buses. Those who drive without a license risk interactions with police at checkpoints or having the car impounded.

**Economic Mobility:** While economic mobility can also be elusive to many citizens, undocumented young adults must try to find stable jobs that do not require a social security number. As a result, many of the college graduates I interviewed work at fast-food restaurants and factories rather than their preferred professions. When they do receive job opportunities,

they often have to turn them down. Pablo Ortiz explains, “I was able to get a job opportunity to work with [a labor union], but I didn’t take it... There’s a big risk of traveling. I was actually one of the so-called randomly selected people [at the airport] for them to check my fingerprints. And that was actually very scary...I’d rather not risk it because if I do get caught up in that thing and get deported, I can’t provide for my daughter.” While citizenship might not guarantee you economic mobility, it at least lets you open the door for opportunity.

**Freedom from Fear:** Undocumented young adults live their lives in fear of being deported and torn away from the productive lives they have built for themselves. Citizens do not live in fear of being sent to a country they do not or of never seeing friends or family ever again. For instance, Janet Godinez explains her legal status to her children so that they are prepared in case she or her husband is taken into custody by immigration and/or deported: “With my kids, what I’ve been telling them is that in case something happens and I don’t go for them at school, to stay in school. Don’t come home, or don’t run away. Don’t get scared...I see that they get sad. And they get thinking about it, but then I tell them we hope that nothing happen to us.” Deportation is a growing concern



given new anti-immigrant policies and rising deportations.

**Freedom from Uncertainty:** While not everyone likes to make extensive plans for the future, citizens at least have the ability to think about the future. Many of the undocumented young adults I interviewed were unable to talk or dream about the future, and some even refused to make plans too far in advance. Adrian Perez explains: “I don’t want to be too positive or optimistic if something happens like deportation...I don’t really want to look into the future because that is what worries me the most. When you look at a future that you know nothing about, you become more and more desperate about the immediate results that you

cannot see.” While citizens may feel uncertain about their futures, at least they know that, for the most part, where they end up in the future largely depends on their own actions and decisions. The future of undocumented young adults lies in the hands of laws and policymakers.

### **Become an Active Ally**

Social justice movements show that recognizing privilege is not enough. Individuals have to actively use their privilege to counter institutional structures of inequality: If you are neutral in situations of injustice, you have chosen the side of the oppressor.

Knowing this and hearing the stories of my respondents, I committed myself to being an ally to the undocumented community. I mentored undocumented high school and college students, helping them find their voices so that they can empower themselves. I participated in community-based organizing with undocumented and citizen individuals working together to pass pro-immigrant legislation like the DREAM Act, which would provide them with a path to legalization.

My work has been fulfilling, but frustrating. I was, and often still am, unsure of how I should participate and when I should speak. As a second-generation Latina, I occupy mul-



multiple marginal social positions: I am simultaneously privileged as a citizen and marginalized as a woman of color. As a woman of color, I knew that I hated when people in positions of privilege spoke for me. and I was determined not to commit similar transgressions with my citizenship privilege. Knowing what I did not want to do, I focused on helping those who are undocumented raise their voices and empower themselves.

I began silencing myself when I participated in training for mainly undocumented immigrant youth. All of the other trainers were undocumented and introduced themselves with what was then the new rallying call of the undocumented student movement: “My name is...and I am undocumented and unafraid!” When I was asked to introduce myself, I stumbled. There was no formula for me to use, no means to explain why I was in this space or cared about these issues. Confused, I tried to explain my feelings to one of my undocumented friends and was disregarded. A few days later I was interviewing a citizen ally for one of my research projects; she haltingly confessed amid tears that she felt guilty for never doing enough. I realized that I too was feeling guilty for feeling upset after the training, for never doing enough.

I feel guilty for having a privilege that I

didn't choose to have. I try to remind myself that citizenship is a privilege and a power and that I need to use to create positive change. And the more I think about it, I begin to feel guilty for feeling guilty about being in a position of privilege. The cycle continues until I tell myself that my feelings and experiences aren't as important, that I am not the one being marginalized. And so I silence myself. I tell myself that I don't have a story. Do we need to silence some people in order to empower others? Feeling invalidated only serves to prevent participation. We know that coalitions fuel stronger and more effective social movements. The trick is building coalitions that can simultaneously empower and validate the stories of all involved individuals, regardless of their social position.

All these experiences have taught me that, as citizens, we need to cautiously embrace our voice in order to challenge dominant ideas about what makes someone a legitimate member of U.S. society. On some level, most of us experience some sort of marginalization. While we may not be able to feel or know each other's struggles, we can understand and sympathize by reflecting on our own experiences with both privileged and marginalized social positions. We can draw on these experiences to help make our society more just.

## **Citizenship Is an Action, Not Just a Piece of Paper**

While interviewing undocumented young adults and being an active ally in the undocumented immigrant youth movement, I began to question what citizenship really means. Who is a good citizen? Should having a U.S. birth certificate really make me a citizen? My perspective was called into question one day as I sorted through my mail. My heart sank as I picked up a letter, a jury summons, from the Los Angeles Superior Court. For most people, this is one of the worst pieces of mail they can receive. My mind raced through the list of things I needed to be doing and the various ways in which this summons was going to prevent me from doing them. When I mentioned it to a few friends, they started telling me how I could get out of it: “You’re an educated woman of color, they don’t want people who can think or are critical of ‘the system.’” We digressed into a discussion of the criminalization of communities of color and the prison industrial complex.

A few days later one of my undocumented friends saw my summons lying on my desk. His response: “You’re so lucky!” Seeing my confusion, he confessed that he wished he could serve on a jury. It was one of the many privileges that his undocumented status for-

bade him. I was surprised, but it made sense. Scholars and activists talk about the limitations that an undocumented status poses to undocumented immigrants: unequal access to higher education, no access to legal employment, fear of deportation, limited access to driver’s licenses, and so on. We don’t talk about the civic responsibilities and privileges, like voting and jury duty, which are also denied undocumented immigrants. I began to feel ashamed about all the complaining my citizen friends and I had been doing only a few days earlier. As we continued to talk, I realized that this was not something to complain or feel guilty about but rather was an opportunity to embrace my privilege and use it for positive change.

My friends and I had criticized the injustices committed by the judicial system but then refused to sacrifice our own time to take part in the system and make a difference on an individual level. Maybe that’s me being overly optimistic, that my one voice on a jury of twelve can make a difference in one trial. If we think about social movement organizing strategies—every additional voice or body at an event makes the group stronger and every vote counts—why should it be different when we think about jury duty?

To encourage participation, we say that every voice counts, but we also reframe the event:

**Scholars and activists talk about the limitations that an undocumented status poses to undocumented immigrants: unequal access to higher education, no access to legal employment, fear of deportation, limited access to driver’s licenses, and so on. We don’t talk about the civic responsibilities and privileges, like voting and jury duty, which are also denied undocumented immigrants.**

rallies to get out the vote become concerts and rallies for social justice issues feature music and celebrity speakers or offer food. A episode of *The Simpsons* explored how to make jury duty more interesting by framing it as “joining the justice squadron at the Municipal Fortress of Vengeance.” So maybe citizenship itself is in need of some reframing so that we can increase civic participation and get citizens to appreciate the privileges we are afforded.

One radical way of reframing citizenship could be to associate formal citizenship with citizen-like action or civic engagement. Not every country assigns citizenship in the same way. Most commonly, you can be a citizen by birth (as in the U.S.) or you can be a citizen by blood based on where your parents or grandparents were citizens (as in Germany). What if we assigned citizenship based on one’s actions? This idea is similar to elementary school awards for “citizenship,” which is really code for participating in class, being respectful of classmates, and helping others. People who live in a country would then have to demonstrate their citizen qualities in order to be granted certain privileges. If we did this, people would be less likely to take their citizenship responsibilities for granted because they would have to work hard to get them.

I know this action-based means of assigning citizenship is highly unlikely and practically impossible to implement. It, however, highlight the two sides of the citizenship coin: it is a legal status but it is also an action. You can be a legal citizen with or without practicing good citizenship. Alternatively, you can be undocumented while practicing good citizenship. This argument is often made to gain support for the DREAM Act. In fact, given my undocumented friend’s reaction to my jury summons, it’s likely that he has the potential to be a better citizen than I. In fact, most of the undocumented young adults I meet are good citizens despite their legal status: they help their families, neighbors, coworkers, friends, and strangers; speak out against injustices; foster abandoned animals; spearhead community clean-ups; and encourage younger community members to stay in school.

These actions give me hope and make me strive to be a better citizen. I’ve decided to maintain my optimism: my voice on a jury, in an election, or at a rally can make a difference. If we each come to live our citizenship, we will be able to make our community a better place, one small action at a time.

Overall, my five years in the field with undocumented young adults has taught me a lot about myself and about what citizenship

means. I hope these few anecdotes encourage you to think about the significance of citizenship in your own life. In addition, I hope this inspires you to reflect on your own fieldwork and on the ways in which it has changed you.

—

**Illustration credits:** illustration on page 16 by Jose Ortiz; photo on page 15 from Immigrant Youth Justice League; and drawing on page 17 by Julio Salgado.



## MARGARET A. PORTER COLLECTION

**A**S I PROCESSED the papers and other materials in the Margaret A. Porter Collection, I learned about much about Margaret's life and work but I also came to realize the importance of bringing such collections like this into the light. The Porter papers provide an excellent example of how significant archival material can document the life of someone from an underrepresented community and also demonstrate the struggles and achievements of a lesbian whose life spanned almost the entire twentieth century.

Margaret Porter was most known for her poetry and for her translations from the French of poetry by Renee Vivien and Natalie Clifford Barney. In addition to Porter's original and translated poetry, the collection contains her personal diaries, which span over six decades of her life,

photographs, and correspondence. In addition, there are materials from her activity in San Diego—based lesbian organizations and documents from her research on Vivien, Barney, and other women in expatriate France.

Porter was born in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, on April 30, 1911 and raised in the Midwest. In an interview with the historian J.R. Roberts, she explained that knew she was "different" from the age of nine but she didn't know the word "lesbian." Later she thought of herself as "one of a chosen few" like Sappho, Oscar Wilde and Tchaikovsky. As she was growing up, she could see no profit in being a woman, girl's clothes, or women's roles and wanted to be a boy. So she pretended she was one, and developed a detailed imaginary life at a young age. This imaginary life would turn out to be the foundation for much of



**Margaret A. Porter (left) in the 1930s.**





**Scenes from a active life: Margaret A. Porter Collec-  
tion in the June L. Mazer Lesbian Archives**

## MAKING INVISIBLE HISTORIES VISIBLE *collection notes from the NEH/Mazer project*

her poetry as she later used it to create several *noms de plume*. Margaret had a lifetime interest in France and anything French, which was reflected in the characters in her imaginary life. These included Pierre E. Renet, Gabrielle L'Autre, and an ideal woman and muse named Alys.

She attended Marquette University, where she received a B.A. in journalism. While in college, Porter first published under the name Pierre E. Renet. All her life, she always made it a point to clarify that she was not a “lesbian poet” but rather, a poet that wrote and translated some lesbian poetry.

The materials in the collection also cover several other periods in Margaret’s life, including her trips to France, her service in the Women’s Army Corps (her uniform is also in the collection), and her time traveling around the United States as a vagabond. While living in Oceanside in her later life, she worked closely with William Moritz to research and translate poetry of Vivien and others. Moritz, who was best known for his research in film history, was fluent in Greek and translated the poetry

of Sappho, while Margaret translated the poetry of Vivien. Margaret’s translations received high praise because she often successfully projected the meter and rhyme of the French original in the English translation, as well as capturing the emotional qualities. Along with Catherine Kroger, Porter was the first to publish English versions of Renee Vivien’s poetry in their book, *Muse of the Violets*, which was published in 1977.

Although the majority of Porter’s own written work remains unpublished, she often contributed to small press publications including *The Archer*, *New Athenaeum*, *South and West*, *Tres Femme*, and *The Ladder* in the 1960s and 1970s. During the same period, she became active in lesbian and feminist groups. Porter served as editor for the local chapter of the Daughters of Bilitis and later as co-founder of the groups Search and Tres Femme, for which she also wrote and edited newsletters and serial publications.

When Porter died on May 30, 1989, at the age of 78, she donated some materials to the Kinsey Institute

Library at Indiana University and gave the rest to William Moritz, who later donated them to the June L. Mazer Lesbian Archives. In a 1979 letter to Porter, a friend wrote, “. . . what a great need that exists for your words to be preserved for future lesbian women.” The processing of the Porter papers—a cooperative effort by between the Mazer Archives, the Center for the Study of Women, and UCLA Special Collections—fills that need by ensuring that Margaret’s work is not only preserved but also made widely accessible.

— Gloria Gonzalez

*Gloria Gonzalez is a M.L.I.S. student in the Department of Information Studies at UCLA and a fellow at the Center for Primary Research and Training working on “Making Invisible Histories Visible: Preserving the Legacy of Lesbian Feminist Activism and Writing in Los Angeles,” a three-year project partially funded by the NEH to arrange, describe, digitize, and make physically and electronically accessible two major clusters of Mazer collections related to West Coast lesbian/feminist activism and writing since the 1930s.*



*This holiday season, consider giving gift to friends, family and co-workers that will last the whole year through... plants! Try House plants with particular air-purifying qualities, like pothos (left), philodendron, and spider plants.*



UCLA CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF WOMEN  
*supporting innovative research on women, gender, and sexuality*



<b>DIRECTOR (on leave Winter/Spring 2013)</b>	<i>Kathleen McHugh</i> PROFESSOR, ENGLISH AND CINEMA AND MEDIA STUDIES
<b>INTERIM DIRECTOR</b>	<i>Rachel Lee</i> ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR, ENGLISH AND WOMEN'S STUDIES
<b>ASSISTANT DIRECTOR</b>	<i>Julie K. Childers, Ph.D.</i>
<b>MANAGING EDITOR</b>	<i>Brenda Johnson-Grau</i>
<b>ADMINISTRATIVE SPECIALIST</b>	<i>Allison Wyper</i>
<b>STUDENT ASSISTANTS</b>	<i>Olga Desyatrik, Kimberlee Granholm, Angel Diaz, Angelica Lai, Magaly Martin, Josh Olejarz, Rylan Ross, Bessie Sanchez, Rana Sharif, Cathy Son, Laura Swanbeck, and Stacy Wood</i>



---

UCLA CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF WOMEN

1500 Public Affairs Building/Box 957222

Los Angeles, CA 90095-7222

campus mailcode: 722203

310 825 0590 / 310 825 0456 (fax)